Get Access to Print and Digital for \$23.99. SUBSCRIBE FOR FULL ACCESS

SIGN IN





ARCHIVE SECTIONS AUTHORS ABOUT STORE

CURRENT ISSUE THE LATEST SEARCH Q

A Letter on Justice and Open Debate

July 7, 2020

The below letter will be appearing in the Letters section of the magazine's October issue. We welcome responses at letters@harpers.org

Our cultural institutions are facing a moment of trial. Powerful protests for racial and social justice are leading to overdue demands for police reform, along with wider calls for greater equality and inclusion across our society, not least in higher education, journalism, philanthropy, and the arts. But this needed reckoning has also intensified a new set of moral attitudes and political commitments that tend to weaken our norms of open debate and toleration of differences in favor of ideological conformity. As we applaud the first development, we also raise our voices against the second. The forces of illiberalism are gaining strength throughout the world and have a powerful ally in Donald Trump, who represents a real threat to democracy. But resistance must not be allowed to harden into its own brand of dogma or coercion—which right-wing demagogues are already exploiting. The democratic inclusion we want can be achieved only if we speak out against the intolerant climate that has set in on all sides.

The free exchange of information and ideas, the lifeblood of a liberal society, is daily becoming more constricted. While we have come to expect this on the radical right, censoriousness is also spreading more widely in our culture: an intolerance of opposing views, a vogue for public shaming and ostracism, and the tendency to dissolve complex policy issues in a blinding moral certainty. We uphold the value of robust and even caustic counter-speech from all quarters. But it is now all too common to hear calls for swift and severe retribution in response to perceived transgressions of speech and thought. More troubling still, institutional leaders, in a spirit of panicked damage control, are delivering hasty and disproportionate punishments instead of considered reforms. Editors are fired for running controversial pieces; books are withdrawn for alleged inauthenticity; journalists are barred from writing on certain topics;

professors are investigated for quoting works of literature in class; a researcher is fired for circulating a peer-reviewed academic study; and the heads of organizations are ousted for what are sometimes just clumsy mistakes. Whatever the arguments around each particular incident, the result has been to steadily narrow the boundaries of what can be said without the threat of reprisal. We are already paying the price in greater risk aversion among writers, artists, and journalists who fear for their livelihoods if they depart from the consensus, or even lack sufficient zeal in agreement.

This stifling atmosphere will ultimately harm the most vital causes of our time. The restriction of debate, whether by a repressive government or an intolerant society, invariably hurts those who lack power and makes everyone less capable of democratic participation. The way to defeat bad ideas is by exposure, argument, and persuasion, not by trying to silence or wish them away. We refuse any false choice between justice and freedom, which cannot exist without each other. As writers we need a culture that leaves us room for experimentation, risk taking, and even mistakes. We need to preserve the possibility of good-faith disagreement without dire professional consequences. If we won't defend the very thing on which our work depends, we shouldn't expect the public or the state to defend it for us.

Elliot Ackerman

Saladin Ambar, Rutgers University

Martin Amis

Anne Applebaum

Marie Arana, author

Margaret Atwood

John Banville

Mia Bay, historian

Louis Begley, writer

Roger Berkowitz, Bard College

Paul Berman, writer

Sheri Berman, Barnard College

Reginald Dwayne Betts, poet

Neil Blair, agent

David W. Blight, Yale University

Jennifer Finney Boylan, author

David Bromwich

David Brooks, columnist

Ian Buruma, Bard College

Susan Madrak, writer

Phoebe Maltz Bovy, writer

Greil Marcus

Wynton Marsalis, Jazz at Lincoln

Center

Kati Marton, author

Debra Mashek, scholar

Deirdre McCloskey, University of

Illinois at Chicago

John McWhorter, Columbia

University

Uday Mehta, City University of New

York

Andrew Moravcsik, Princeton

University

Yascha Mounk, Persuasion

Samuel Moyn, Yale University

Meera Nanda, writer and teacher

Cary Nelson, University of Illinois at

Lea Carpenter Urbana-Champaign

Noam Chomsky, MIT (emeritus) Olivia Nuzzi, New York Magazine

Nicholas A. Christakis, Yale Mark Oppenheimer, Yale University

University Dael Orlandersmith,

Roger Cohen, writer writer/performer

Ambassador Frances D. Cook, ret. George Packer

Drucilla Cornell, Founder, uBuntu Nell Irvin Painter, Princeton

Project University (emerita)

Kamel Daoud Greg Pardlo, Rutgers University -

Meghan Daum, writer Camden

Gerald Early, Washington University- Orlando Patterson, Harvard

St. Louis University

Jeffrey Eugenides, writer Steven Pinker, Harvard University

Dexter Filkins Letty Cottin Pogrebin

Federico Finchelstein, The New Katha Pollitt, writer

School Claire Bond Potter, The New School

Caitlin Flanagan Taufiq Rahim, New America

Richard T. Ford, Stanford Law School Foundation

Kmele Foster Zia Haider Rahman, writer

David Frum, journalist Jennifer Ratner-Rosenhagen,

Francis Fukuyama, Stanford University of Wisconsin

University Jonathan Rauch, Brookings

Atul Gawande, Harvard University Institution/The Atlantic

Todd Gitlin, Columbia University Neil Roberts, political theorist

Kim Ghattas Melvin Rogers, Brown University

Malcolm Gladwell Kat Rosenfield, writer

Michelle Goldberg, columnist Loretta J. Ross, Smith College

Rebecca Goldstein, writer J.K. Rowling

Anthony Grafton, Princeton Salman Rushdie, New York University

University Karim Sadjadpour, Carnegie

David Greenberg, Rutgers University Endowment

Linda Greenhouse Daryl Michael Scott, Howard

Rinne B. Groff, playwright University

Sarah Haider, activist Diana Senechal, teacher and writer

Jonathan Haidt, NYU-Stern Jennifer Senior, columnist

Roya Hakakian, writer Judith Shulevitz, writer

Shadi Hamid, Brookings Institution Jesse Singal, journalist

Jeet Heer, The Nation Anne-Marie Slaughter

Katie Herzog, podcast host Andrew Solomon, writer

Susannah Heschel, Dartmouth Deborah Solomon, critic and

College biographer

Adam Hochschild, author Allison Stanger, Middlebury College

Arlie Russell Hochschild, author Paul Starr, American

Eva Hoffman, writer Prospect/Princeton University

Coleman Hughes, writer/Manhattan Wendell Steavenson, writer

Institute Gloria Steinem, writer and activist

Hussein Ibish, Arab Gulf States Nadine Strossen, New York Law

Institute School

Michael Ignatieff Ronald S. Sullivan Jr., Harvard Law

Zaid Jilani, journalist School

Bill T. Jones, New York Live Arts

Kian Tajbakhsh, Columbia University

Wendy Kaminer, writer Zephyr Teachout, Fordham University

Matthew Karp, Princeton University Cynthia Tucker, University of South

Garry Kasparov, Renew Democracy Alabama

Initiative Adaner Usmani, Harvard University

Daniel Kehlmann, writer Chloe Valdary

Randall Kennedy Lucía Martínez Valdivia, Reed

Khaled Khalifa, writer College

Parag Khanna, author Helen Vendler, Harvard University

Laura Kipnis, Northwestern University Judy B. Walzer

Frances Kissling, Center for Health, Michael Walzer

Ethics, Social Policy Eric K. Washington, historian

Enrique Krauze, historian Caroline Weber, historian

Anthony Kronman, Yale University Randi Weingarten, American

Joy Ladin, Yeshiva University Federation of Teachers

Nicholas Lemann, Columbia Bari Weiss

University Sean Wilentz, Princeton University

Mark Lilla, Columbia University Garry Wills

Susie Linfield, New York University Thomas Chatterton Williams,

Damon Linker, writer writer

Dahlia Lithwick, Slate Robert F. Worth, journalist and

Steven Lukes, New York University author

John R. MacArthur, publisher, Molly Worthen, University of North

writer Carolina at Chapel Hill

Matthew Yglesias

Emily Yoffe, journalist

Cathy Young, journalist

Fareed Zakaria

Institutions are listed for identification purposes only.

<u>CURRENT ISSUE</u> <u>THE LATEST</u> <u>ARCHIVE</u> <u>ABOUT</u>

HARPER'S

Subscribe for Full Access

Advertising Contact Masthead Media

<u>Internships</u> <u>Classifieds</u> <u>Submissions</u> <u>Store</u>

FAQ <u>Customer Care</u> <u>Privacy Policy</u>

© Copyright 2020 Harper's Magazine Foundation Do Not Sell My Personal Information





